



# Shaping Rule of Law Through Dialogue

International and Supranational Experiences

Edited by Filippo Fontanelli, Giuseppe Martinico & Paolo Carrozza



Europa Law Publishing

55-098

# Shaping Rule of Law Through Dialogue

International and Supranational Experiences

Edited by Filippo Fontanelli, Giuseppe Martinico & Paolo Carrozza



	<i>Contents</i>	v
FOREWORD	<b>'Constitutional Justice' Requires Judicial Cooperation and 'Comity' in the Protection of 'Rule of Law'</b> Ernst-Ulrich Petersmann	1
1	Introduction	3
2	Conservative and Reformative Conceptions of Justice	3
3	Universal and Particular Conceptions of Justice	4
4	Constitutional Conceptions of Justice	4
5	Constitutional Justice as Institutionalized 'Public Reason'	7
6	Justice Requires Multilevel Constitutionalism Limiting Multilevel Governance	8
7	Need for Multilevel Constitutional Theories of Transnational Adjudication and 'Rule of Law'	11
8	Multilevel Judicial Protection of 'Rule of Law' in International Economic Law	13
9	International 'Rule of Law' and 'Judicial Comity' Depend on Respect for the Legitimacy of Multilevel 'Constitutional Pluralism'	14
10	Multilevel Judicial Extension of 'Rule of Law' Beyond the State and Beyond International Economic Law Depends on 'Constitutional Justice'	15
INTRO	<b>Introduction</b> Filippo Fontanelli, Giuseppe Martinico & Paolo Carrozza	21
CHAPTER 1	<b><i>Dédoublément fonctionnel</i> and the Mixed Loyalties of National and International Judges</b> Yuval Shany	27
	Introduction	29
1	The Blurring of Traditional Distinctions	30
2	The Conceptual Problems of Multiple Constituencies and Mixed Loyalties	34
3	Concluding Observations	40
CHAPTER 2	<b>Forum Shopping before International Tribunals. (Real) Concerns, (Im)Possible Solutions</b> Joost Pauwelyn, Luiz Eduardo Salles	45
	Introduction	47
1	Forum Shopping in International Law: Identifying the Real Concern	48

	II	Where to Look for Solutions	53
	III	Jurisdiction vs. Admissibility: Implementing Jurisdictional Coordination Between Autonomous International Tribunals	59
	IV	Why Domestic Analogies Do Not Work in the International Context	69
	V	A Reformulated Forum Non Conveniens Principle: <i>Le Juge Naturel</i> or Natural Forum	80
	VI	Conclusion	84
CHAPTER 3		<b>In the Court(s) We Trust? On the Need for Hierarchy and Differentiation in the Preliminary Ruling Procedure</b> Jan Komárek	89
	I	Introduction	91
	II	Arguments against Limitation of the Preliminary Ruling Procedure to Last Instance Courts	93
	III	Efficiency of the Court of Justice	104
	IV	A Model Proposed: Hierarchy and Differentiation Combined	109
	V	Conclusion	116
CHAPTER 4		<b>Revisiting Article 307 EC. The Untouchable Core of Fundamental European Constitutional Law Values and Principles</b> Nikolaos Lavranos	119
	1	Introduction	121
	2	The Author's Mindset: The Asymmetric Relationship Between International Law and Community Law	121
	3	Article 307 EC: The Awakening of a Sleeping Giant	123
	3.1	The <i>Kadi</i> Judgment – The New Concept of the 'Very Foundations of the Community Legal Order'	126
	3.2	From the 'Effect-Based' Test to the Concept of 'Hypothetical Incompatibilities'	131
	3.3	The <i>BITs</i> Judgments – The Concept of 'Hypothetical Incompatibilities'	136
	4	Outlook	141
CHAPTER 5		<b>Judicial Review of United Nations Counter-Terrorism Sanctions in the European Multilevel System of Human Rights Protection. A Case Study in Ineffectiveness</b> Federico Fabbrini	147
	I	Introduction	149
	II	Multilevel Protection of Fundamental Rights in Europe and the Problem of Ineffectiveness	149

III	A Case Study: Judicial Review of UN Counter-Terrorism Sanctions	155
A.	Context	157
B.	Lack of Judicial Review	159
1.	The ECJ	160
2.	The National Courts and the ECtHR	163
C.	Unsatisfactory Developments	166
1.	The ECJ	166
2.	The National Courts and the ECtHR	170
D.	The Rise of Judicial Review	173
1.	The ECJ	174
2.	The Lisbon Treaty	176
E.	'A Judge in Berlin'	178
IV	Conclusion	179
CHAPTER 6	<b>Overcoming Dissonance to Reshape Coherence. The European Court of Justice, Terrorist Lists and the Rule of Law</b>	
	Stanislas Adam	191
1	The Previous Discrepancy in Judicial Review	194
2	First Attempts towards Convergence: the <i>Ayadi, Hassan and Minin</i> Cases (CFI)	203
3	The Judgment of the ECJ in <i>Kadi</i> : Reintroducing Coherence through Reshaping Core Constitutional Principles	206
4	Reshaping the Rule of Law through Multi-Level 'Incentive Dialogue'	213
5	Conclusion	215
CHAPTER 7	<b>Preliminary Reference and Constitutional Courts. Are You in the Mood for Dialogue?</b>	
	Giuseppe Martinico	221
	Preliminary Remarks	223
1	The Phenomenon in a Nutshell	224
1.1	The Italian Decision in Context	227
1.2	Final Remarks on this Point	235
2	Looking for the Macro-Reasons for Such a New Trend	237
2.1	Margin of Appreciation	238
2.2	One Step Further: From Constitutionalization to the Idea of the Untouchable Core (i.e. the Absolute Rights in the Case Law of the ECJ)	241
3	Are We Watching a Happy Ending? The ECJ under Siege	245
4	Synopsis	249

CHAPTER 8	<b>ECJ and Administrative Courts in EU Member States. Towards a Common Judicial Reasoning?</b> Fulvio Cortese	255
1	Introduction	257
2	A Possible Interpretation	257
3	Relationships between Legal Systems: European Solutions and [...] National Reasoning	259
4	Effectiveness of European Law: 'Simple' Cases and [...] 'Rhetorical' Decisions	266
5	Conclusions	269
CHAPTER 9	<b><i>Behrami and Saramati</i>: When Silence Matters</b> Antonella Angelini	275
1	Introduction	277
2	The Posture of the ECtHR in <i>Behrami</i>	279
2.1	A. Summary of the <i>Behrami</i> Decision	280
2.2	When Silence Matters; What the Court Avoids in <i>Behrami</i>	282
3	Concluding Observations	293
CHAPTER 10	<b>The Relationship between the ICC and Other International Tribunals. An Analysis of the Lubanga Confirmation of Charges</b> Rosa Raffaelli	299
1	Introduction	301
2	Conflicts with Regard to Rules of International Law: The <i>Nicaragua</i> and <i>Tadic</i> Cases	302
3	Reiteration of the Conflict: The <i>Genocide</i> Case	305
4	Overlaps in Factual Assessments: the Qualification of the Armed Conflict in Ituri, DRC	307
5	Did the PTC Have the Power to Amend the Charges?	310
6	Is a Different Factual Assessment by Different International Tribunals to be Avoided at All Costs?	313
7	Conclusions	316
CHAPTER 11	<b>Trade Remedies Disputes – Reciprocal Relationship between WTO and NAFTA Tribunals</b> Jorge A. Huerta-Goldman	319
	Outline of the Chapter	321
	Introduction	321
1	Background	322

1.1	The AD/CVD Investigations in a Nutshell	322
1.2	WTO Dispute Settlement Procedures	324
1.3	Panels under Art. 1904 of NAFTA (Chapter 19 of NAFTA)	326
2	The Reciprocal Relationship between NAFTA and WTO Tribunals	327
2.1	Cases where one Tribunal Followed the Findings of the Other	328
2.1.1	Mexico's AD Order on Corn Syrup HFCS	328
2.1.2	US AD Order on OCTG	329
2.1.3	US AD Order on Cement	329
2.1.4	US AD/CVD Orders on Softwood Lumber	332
2.1.4.1	The Dumping Determination on Softwood Lumber	334
2.1.4.2	The Injury Determination on Softwood Lumber	335
2.1.4.4	The CVD Determination on Softwood Lumber	336
2.2	Parallel Procedures with no Finding by one Tribunal	339
2.2.1	Mexico's AD order on Bovine	339
2.2.2	US AD Order on Tomatoes	339
2.2.3	US AD Order on Stainless Steel and Strip	340
2.2.4	US AD Order on Live Cattle	340
2.2.5	US AD/CVD Order on Wheat	341
3	Observations	341
4	Conclusions	342
CHAPTER 12	<b>The Dialogue between Judges &amp; Experts in the EU and WTO</b>	
	Alberto Alemanno	345
1	Introduction	347
2	The Scientific Evidence Requirement	348
3	How to Improve the Role of the Judge in the Review of Science-Based Measures?	350
3.1	The Role of Experts in Judicial Review: The External Expert Consultation in the WTO	351
4	Towards an EC Expert Consultation System?	362
5	The Role of Peer Review in Judicial Control	364
6	Some Proposals to Help the Judge When Reviewing Science	368
6.1	How Can a Judge Assess Whether a Scientific Study is 'Scientifically Adequate'?	369
6.2	What is a Minimum Scientific Threshold?	370
7	Conclusions	373

CHAPTER 13	<b>Whose Margin Is It? State Discretion and Judges' Appreciation in the Necessity Quicksand</b> Filippo Fontanelli	377
1	Introduction	379
2	The Necessity Test and the Least-Restrictive Means Doctrine	382
3	Previous Case Law	384
3.1	GATT Precedents and Analogies with Art. XXI GATT	384
3.2	WTO Case Law; Early Cases	387
3.3	WTO Case Law; Recent Cases	394
4	Tentative Conclusions: Who Gets the Margin in the WTO?	402
5	Reallocation of Regulatory Authority and the Role of Principles	404
CHAPTER 14	<b>Global Threads: Weaving the Rule of Law and the Balance of Legal Software</b> Gianluigi Palombella	413
1	Hardware to Software	415
2	Contestability	417
3	Persistence	421
4	Duality: the Balance of Legal Software as a Matter of the Rule of Law	425